UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE AT GREENEVILLE

B.P., H.A., and S.H., individually, and on)
behalf of all others similarly situated,	
Plaintiffs,)
v.) No: 2:23-cv-00071-TRM-JEM) JURY DEMAND
CITY OF JOHNSON CITY, TENNESSEE,)
a government entity, et al.,)
Defendants.)

DEFENDANT CITY OF JOHNSON CITY'S MOTION FOR A PROTECTIVE ORDER PURSUANT TO FED. R. EVID. 26 AND/OR MOTION TO QUASH SUBPOENA DUCES TECUM ISSUED TO VERIZON WIRELESS PURSUANT TO FED. R. CIV. P. 45

Defendant City of Johnson City, Tennessee ("City" or "Johnson City") hereby appears, by and through counsel, in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c) and 45, and moves this Court for a protective order and/or an order quashing the *subpoena duces tecum* served on Verizon Wireless (hereinafter, "Verizon"), for the personal and/or work cellular phone data for four (4) non-parties. For the reasons set forth below, the subpoena issued to Verizon should be quashed and/or a Protective Order entered, because the subpoena amounts to an overbroad fishing expedition.

- 1. The City asks that the subpoena for Mike Street's personal cell phone records be quashed in its entirety, since he had retired from the JCPD prior to any of the events alleged in Plaintiffs' Complaint.
- 2. Regarding Captain Mike Adams' JCPD-issued phone records and Lt. David Hilton's personal cell phone records, the City asks the Court to quash Plaintiffs' subpoena to

Verizon and allow counsel for the City to produce the records it receives from Verizon subject to the following limitations:

- a. The City can redact all data and calls from January 1, 2024 to the present.
- b. The Plaintiffs must provide counsel for the City with specific numbers and/or individuals to apply to the remaining data and call logs. All other calls and data will be redacted.
- c. Alternatively, the City will redact any personal and/or non-relevant calls and data from the logs.
- d. The records will be produced subject to the parties Agreed Protective Order; and
- e. The Plaintiffs are barred from contacting any of the numbers contained on the call logs.
- 3. The City maintains that the Verizon subpoena is overly broad and not proportionate to the needs of the case, because it seeks <u>all call logs and data</u> for broad ranges of dates. Through their subpoena, the Plaintiffs make no attempt to limit the data sought to information relevant to their claims. By seeking <u>all data and call logs</u>, without any limitations as to content or number, the Plaintiffs are essentially conceding that the information produced will include personal calls and data unrelated to the instant litigation. This type of blind search for something useful for the Plaintiffs is explicitly disallowed by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedures, which limits discovery to "information relevant to any party's claim or defense and proportional to the needs of the case..." Fed. R. Civ. Pro. 26(b)(1). See also Mackelprang v. Fid. Nat'l Title Agency of Nev., Inc., No. 2:06-cv-00788-JCM-GWF, 2007 WL 119149, at *2 (D. Nev. Jan. 9, 2007).

4. Counsel for the City conferred with Plaintiffs' counsel in good faith in an effort to resolve this dispute without court intervention, and counsel was unable to reach an agreement regarding the Verizon subpoena. (Declaration of Emily C. Taylor, ¶¶ 9-11).

In Support of its Motion for a Protective Order and/or Motion to Quash, the City relies upon its Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion for a Protective Order and/or Motion to Quash, filed contemporaneously with the instant Motion, the Declaration of Emily C. Taylor, and Exhibits 1-3 to the Declaration of Emily C. Taylor.

RESPECTFULLY submitted this 29th day of August, 2024.

CITY OF JOHNSON CITY, TN

By:s/ Emily C. Taylor

Emily C. Taylor, BPR # 027157 WATSON, ROACH, BATSON & LAUDERBACK, P.L.C.

P.O. Box 131

Knoxville, TN 37901-0131

Phone: (865) 637-1700

Email: etaylor@watsonroach.com

Erickson Herrin, BPR # 012110

HERRIN, McPEAK & ASSOCIATES

515 East Unaka Avenue

P. O. Box 629

Johnson City, TN 37605-0629

Phone: (423) 929-7113

Email: rachel@hbm-lawfirm.com

Jonathan P. Lakey, BPR # 016788

BURCH, PORTER & JOHNSON, PLLC

130 North Court Avenue

Memphis, TN 38103

Phone: (901) 524-5024

Email: jlakey@bpjlaw.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing was filed electronically. Notice of this filing will be sent by operation of the Court's electronic filing system to all parties indicated on the electronic filing receipt. All other parties will be served by regular U.S. mail. Parties may access this filing through the Court's electronic filing system:

Heather Moore Collins Ashley Shoemaker Walter HMC CIVIL RIGHTS LAW, PLLC 7000 Executive Center Drive, Suite 320 Brentwood, TN 37027 Counsel for Plaintiffs

Kevin Osborne
Elizabeth Kramer
Julie Erickson
ERICKSON KRAMER OSBORNE, LLP
44 Tehama Street
San Francisco, CA 94105
Counsel for Plaintiffs

Kristin Ellis Berexa
Ben C. Allen
FARRAR & BATES
12 Cadillac Drive, Suite 480
Brentwood, TN 37027-5366
Counsel for Toma Sparks in his individual capacity

Vanessa Baehr-Jones ADVOCATES FOR SURVIVORS OF ABUSE, PC 4200 Park Boulevard No. 413 Oakland, CA 94602 Counsel for Plaintiffs

Daniel H. Rader IV
Daniel H. Rader III
André S. Greppin
MOORE, RADER & YORK PC
46 N. Jefferson Avenue
P.O. Box 3347
Cookeville, TN 38502-3347
Counsel for Kevin Peters in his individual capacity

Keith H. Grant
Laura Beth Rufolo
Philip Aaron Wells
ROBINSON, SMITH & WELLS, PLLC
Suite 700, Republic Centre
633 Chestnut Street
Chattanooga, TN 37450
Counsel for Justin Jenkins in his individual
capacity

Jerome Cochran, Esq.
GARZA LAW FIRM
118 East Watauga Avenue
Johnson City, TN 37601
Counsel for Non-Party Alunda Rutherford

Mary Elizabeth McCullohs
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
P.O. Box 20207
Nashville, TN 37202-0207
(615) 741-8126
Counsel for Non-Party, the District Attorney
General's Office for the First Judicial District

Dated this 29th day of August, 2024.

s/Emily C. Taylor, BPR No. 27157 EMILY C. TAYLOR, BPR # 027157 WATSON, ROACH, BATSON & LAUDERBACK, P.L.C. P.O. Box 131

Knoxville, TN 37901-0131 Phone: (865) 637-1700

Email: etaylor@watsonroach.com